

**Barnsley Five Year 'Deliverable' Housing Land
Supply Report
April 2014 – March 2019**



BARNSLEY
Metropolitan Borough Council

PREPARED BY BARNSLEY METROPOLITAN BOROUGH COUNCIL

March 2016

Barnsley Housing Supply – 1st April 2014 – 31st March 2019

5 Year ‘Deliverable’ Housing Land Supply

Contents

1. Introduction	3
2. The Requirement	3
3. The ‘Deliverable’ Supply	5
4. Overall Conclusion	8
5. Appendix 1: Original Core Strategy Housing Trajectory	9
6. Appendix 2: Schedule of Sites included in 5 year supply	
7. Appendix 3: 5 year supply summary table	

Appendices 2 and 3 are available as a separate document on the Council website.

1. Introduction

1.1 Barnsley Core Strategy policy CSP9 states that ‘a minimum five year supply of deliverable sites will be maintained’ for residential development. Additionally since the adoption of the Core Strategy the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) has been published. The NPPF is clear that Local Planning Authorities should ‘identify and update annually a supply of specific, deliverable sites to provide five years worth of housing against their housing requirements’ (Paragraph 47).

1.2 The purpose of this note is to lay out how the authority determines what the housing requirement is for the relevant five year period and to explain how the supply of housing sites in the borough has been assessed to determine ‘deliverability’ as defined in footnote 11 of the NPPF.

1.3 This note is a follow up to the earlier 5 Year Land Supply reports. However the structure and methodologies used in this report differ from those utilised in these earlier notes and follows the format first used in the 2012 – 2017 report. This was as a result of moving to a more evidence based methodology

1.4 The note concludes that for this five year period the authority cannot demonstrate a ‘deliverable’ five year supply.

1.5 Site schedules are provided in the appendices to this note laying out in detail the deliverability assessment for all sites with planning permission for ten dwellings or more, remaining undeveloped Unitary Development Plan (UDP) housing proposals and redundant school sites. Site schedule appendices can be found in a separate document available on the Councils website alongside this report. Details of the methodologies used to assess deliverability of different types of site are explained in detail in section 3 of this note.

2. The Requirement

2.1 Core Strategy Policy CSP9 seeks to achieve the completion of at least 21500 net additional homes during the period 2008 to 2026. The housing target and trajectory (Appendix 1) is based on a commitment to a housing growth agenda which included RSS targets plus 8 years at 21% above RSS figures and an increment of approximately 1500 dwellings in order to give added robustness to the Core Strategy and allow for a strengthening role for Barnsley in regional and city regional housing strategies.

2.2 The trajectory is based on the commitment to a housing growth agenda but tempered in the period 2009-2015 acknowledging the difficulties of the housing market due to the global recession during 2009-10 and recognising that the economy was unlikely to recover and start to grow before 2014. The trajectory reflects the poor economic conditions at that time and is considered to be an accurate reflection of the market ability to deliver dwellings during the economic downturn. This is demonstrated in Figure 1 which displays actual delivery against targets. The return to higher levels of completions will depend on the confidence and strength of the national economy and housing market and the trajectory provides an estimate or the profile by which the national recovery in the housing market could be translated into local housing activity.

2.3 The Council has an accurate monitoring system for housing based on quarterly updates which provides reliable and detailed information to feed into decisions regarding housing land supply.

Updating the Trajectory

2.4 Core Strategy Policy CSP9 includes a requirement for 21514 net new homes over the plan period from 2008/09 to 2025/26. As the plan period progresses the trajectory is updated with actual completion data.

2.5 The table below shows actual net completions compared to the net trajectory requirement between the start of the Core Strategy plan period in 2008/09 and 2013/14. For 2008/09 and 2009/10 the net trajectory requirement was calculated using actual data on losses in those years as understood at the time the original trajectory was drawn up. The original Core Strategy trajectory can be found in appendix 1. Additional data since this time has led to slight adjustments to the numbers for 2009/10 as shown in the actual net completions column below. From 2010/11 onwards the net trajectory requirement is calculated using an estimate of losses from the gross trajectory requirement. Any difference between the net trajectory requirement and net actual completions needs to be accommodated through the trajectory within the 5 Year Land Supply timeline.

Figure 1: Net housing completions 08/09-13/14

Year	Gross Trajectory Requirement	Net Trajectory Requirement	Net Actual Completions	Difference Between Requirement and Completions
08/09	1096	860	840	-20
09/10	797	546	556	10
10/11	850	700	998	298
11/12	900	800	840	40
12/13	950	862	657	-205
13/14	1100	996	747	-249
Total	4593	3768	4638	-126

2.3 The above table shows that the borough is in a deficit over this period by 126 dwellings. This increases the net requirement over the period 2014/15 to 2018/19 by 25 dwellings a year for the first 4 years and 26 dwellings for the 5th year. The gross requirement also needs to be adjusted by the same amount. An adjustment has also been made for lower losses based on emerging evidence. The annual loss figure is reduced from 50 dwellings per annum down to 25.

2.4 The table below shows the housing trajectory over the remainder of the plan period taking into account adjustments as laid out above. This revised and updated trajectory is used to determine the basic net requirement for the 2014/15 to 2018/19 five year period.

Figure 2: Updated housing trajectory

Updated 2012/13 Barnsley Housing Trajectory (2008/09 to 2025/26)			
Year	Gross Dwellings	Losses	Net Dwellings
2008-09*	1076	236	840
2009-10*	793	237	556
2010-11*	1153	155	998
2011-12*	919	79	840
2012-13*	728	71	657
2013-14*	821	74	747
2014-15	1150	25	1125
2015-16	1250	25	1225
2016-17	1450	25	1425
2017-18	1500	25	1475
2018-19	1501	25	1476
2019-20	1475	25	1450
2020-21	1475	25	1450
2021-22	1475	25	1450
2022-23	1475	25	1450
2023-24	1475	25	1450
2024-25	1475	25	1450
2025-26	1475	25	1450
2008/26 overall requirement	22666	1152	21514
2013/14 – 2025/26 requirement	17176	300	16876
2013/14-2017/18 five year requirement	6851	125	6726

* Based on actual recorded completions and losses.

2.5 The basic five year net requirement for the 2014/5 to 2018/19 period is 6726 dwellings net.

The NPPF Buffer

2.6 The NPPF requires that the five year housing net requirement is buffered by bringing forward an additional 5% of the basic net requirement from later in the plan period. This is to 'ensure choice and competition in the market for land'. Where there 'has been a record of persistent under delivery of housing' this buffer should increase to 20%. It is considered reasonable to utilise the Core Strategy Trajectory to determine whether there has been a persistent under delivery. In accordance with the Sketchley House appeal (APP/K2420/A/13/22083) the use of a trajectory is considered a reasonable and sensible approach based on the unlikelihood of a uniform delivery and reality of economic cycles. The Core Strategy trajectory anticipated a period of reduced delivery but sought to boost the supply of housing overall through an uplifted housing target.

2.6 The table below lays out housing delivery in the borough over the last 10 years and compares it to the annual net requirement for each year.

Figure 3: Housing delivery 2004/05-2013/14

Year	Gross Dwellings	Losses	Net Dwellings	Net Requirement	Difference between requirement and delivery
2004-05	1497	192	1305	840	+465
2005-06	1101	166	935	840	+95
2006-07	1093	177	916	840	+76
2007-08	1497	355	1142	840	+302
2008-09	1076	236	840	860	-20

2009-10	793	237	556	546	+10
2010-11	1153	155	998	700	+298
2011-12	919	79	840	800	+40
2012-13	728	71	657	862	-205
2013/14	821	74	747	996	-249

1. The net requirement for 2002-03 to 2007-08 is derived from the Yorkshire & Humber Regional Spatial Strategy which has now been revoked but which set the borough's requirement at this time.
2. The net requirement for 2007-08 to 2012-13 is derived from the original Core Strategy trajectory.

2.8 The above table demonstrates that Barnsley has a record of consistently delivering housing above its net requirement. Over the ten year period the borough has delivered a surplus of 812 dwellings. This justifies the use of a 5% buffer as described above.

2.9 The table below lays out the net requirement taking into account an NPPF buffer of 5%

Figure 4: Net housing requirement following adjustment

Year	Original Core Strategy Trajectory Net Requirement	Adjusted Net Requirement (08/09 – 13/14 Deficit)	5% NPPF Buffer	Actual Net Requirement
14/15	1100	1125	56	1181
15/16	1200	1225	61	1286
16/17	1400	1425	71	1496
17/18	1450	1475	74	1549
18/19	1450	1476	74	1550
Total	6600	6726	336	7062

2.10 The above table shows that the overall net requirement for the borough for the five year period 2014/15 to 2018/19 is 7062 net dwellings.

3. The 'Deliverable' Supply

Overall Supply

3.1 The table below lays out the overall gross supply in the borough as of 1st April 2014 without any adjustments to account for 'deliverability'.

Figure 5: Deliverable housing supply (gross)

Dwellings with Planning Permission on Sites with 10 or more Dwellings	Dwellings with Planning Permission on sites with less than 10 Dwellings	UDP Housing Proposal	Redundant School Sites	Additional Sites	Total Supply
4011	729	1708	1416	1018	4912

3.2 The NPPF is clear that sites in the forward supply need to be assessed for 'deliverability'. Footnote 11 of the NPPF expands on this and states that:

'To be considered deliverable, sites should be available now, offer a suitable location for development now, and be achievable with a realistic prospect that housing will be delivered on the site within five years and in particular that development of the site is viable. Sites with planning permission should be considered deliverable until permission expires, unless there is clear evidence that schemes will not be implemented within five years, for example they will not be viable, there is no longer a demand for the type of units or sites have long term phasing plans'.

This definition has been taken into account when assessing sites for 'deliverability' and this is expanded upon in the relevant sections below.

Assessment of Deliverability

Sites with planning permission for 10 dwellings or more

3.3 The NPPF is clear that sites with planning permission should be considered deliverable until the permission expires unless there is clear evidence that they will not be implemented in the five year period.

3.4 To ascertain if there was evidence that any of these sites would not be delivered, analysis was undertaken on the sites. Where private market housing sites were commenced, an estimate was made on how many dwellings would be delivered based on recent delivery. For RSL / Local Authority applications it was assumed all dwellings would be delivered in 5 years.

3.5 For planning applications not commenced, and for stalled sites, contact was made with applicants and / or landowners by way of a questionnaire asking for information on likely delivery. A deadline was given on the questionnaire for a response to be sent to the Council.

3.6 Where it was not possible to gain a market response about a site an Officer Assessment Group was formed to assess each site based on local knowledge. The conclusions of this group have been used to demonstrate the deliverable supply on sites where the Council was not able to get a response. Additionally some sites deliverability was assessed by research (for example where the site is now built out)

3.7 The schedule in Appendix 2 lays out the deliverability assessment for each of these sites.

3.8 Based on the methodology outlined above from the 4011 dwellings with planning permission on larger sites 2263 are considered to be deliverable over the five year period.

Sites with planning permission for fewer than 10 dwellings

3.9 It is not practical to assess deliverability on small sites with less than 10 dwellings on a site by site basis. Therefore an evidentially derived discount has been used. This was calculated by analysing the 5 year build out rates for dwellings with full planning consent that had not been completed on the monitoring system in 2008 and 2009. Prior to the recession, they had been fairly constant at a build out rate of 70% which fell to 56% in 2008 and 48% in 2009. It is not anticipated that the dwellings not completed in 2014 will have such low build out rates, however to be cautious, a 60% build out rate was applied to all dwellings included in full permissions for less than ten dwellings on the monitoring system on 1st April 2014. At this date there were 729 dwellings with full planning permission on smaller sites. With a build out discount of 60% of the total supply this means that 437 dwellings will be deliverable over the five year period.

3.10 The average build out rate for small outline permissions was estimated at 30%. There were 100 dwellings with outline permission on small sites on the monitoring system as at 1st April 2014 giving a total of 30 dwellings that will be deliverable over the five year period. In total this means there will be 407.4 deliverable dwellings from sites with permission for less than 10 dwellings over the five year period.

Undeveloped UDP Housing Proposals

3.11 There are a number of UDP housing proposals in the borough that have not been developed. These have been assessed using the same methods as used to assess larger planning applications which are laid out above (paragraphs 3.5 – 3.6). Additionally as many of these sites are in Council ownership officers have liaised with colleagues responsible for asset disposal in order to assess deliverability. This market information has been used to demonstrate the deliverable supply on sites where the Council was able to get a response. Where no response was received the Officer Assessment Group conclusions have been used to demonstrate the deliverable supply.

3.12 The Schedule in Appendix 3 lays out the deliverability assessment for each of these sites.

3.13 There is the potential for 1739 dwellings on UDP housing proposals. Based on the methodology outlined above 152 dwellings are considered to be deliverable over the five year period on these sites.

Redundant School Sites

3.14 The borough has a number of large, redundant school sites that may come forward for development in the five year period. All these sites are in Council ownership and as a result officers have liaised with colleagues responsible for asset disposal in order to assess deliverability. This market information has been used to demonstrate the deliverable supply on these sites.

3.15 The Schedule in Appendix 3 lays out the deliverability assessment for each of these sites.

3.16 There is the potential for 1054 dwellings on redundant school sites. Using the methodology outlined above 347 dwellings are considered to be developable over the five year period on these sites.

Additional Sites

3.17 NPPG is clear that providing there are no significant constraints to overcome such as infrastructure, sites not allocated within a development plan or without planning permissions can be considered capable of being delivered within a five year timeframe. It is on this basis that UDP safeguarded sites and Urban Greenspace that have been assessed through the SHLAA and housing site selection process for the Local Plan are considered for their suitability for inclusion in the 5 year land supply based on likely deliverability. Figure 8 below sets out 'other sites' contribution to the 5 year supply. Further support for this approach can be demonstrated through the Local Planning Authority's recent positive determination of residential applications on UDP Safeguarded land in accordance with the NPPF Presumption.

3.18 In favour of sustainable development our approach is based on the following:

- a) evidence of willing landowner/complexity of ownership
- b) evidence of developer interest (through pre application discussions and local plan representations)
- c) assessment of the sites suitability based on location in Urban Barnsley or Principal Town.
- d) whether site(s) proposed for allocation in emerging Local Plan and assessment through housing site selection methodology to determine site constraints, viability and ability to overcome constraints without significant intervention.
- e) an absence of objections to sites (or satisfied that objections are of little substance based on robust housing site selection methodology)

Windfall Allowance

3.19 The NPPF, at paragraph 48, states that local planning authorities may make an allowance for windfalls in their five year supply 'if they have compelling evidence that such sites have consistently become available in the local area and will continue to provide a reliable source of supply'. It is important to consider the NPPF definition of windfalls in relation to this paragraph as 'sites which have not been specifically identified as available in the local plan process'.

3.20 Windfalls have historically comprised a significant element of completions in the borough and it is reasonable to include an allowance in the five year supply. A methodology has been devised which allows an allowance to be calculated which is based on evidence taking into account the NPPF windfall definition.

3.21 The number of full and reserved matters windfall dwellings (as defined in the NPPF) granted, on new sites, in the last 3 years is shown below:

Figure 6: Windfall dwellings

Year	Windfall Dwellings
2011/12	307
2012/13	258
2013/14	284

3.22 The methodology takes an average of the above 3 years to arrive at an estimate that 283 windfalls will be granted each year up to 2018/19. Evidence from 2008/09 shows what percent of windfalls granted were built out in the 5 subsequent years (Build Out % in the table below). When this is applied cumulatively 53.7% of those granted in the first year were built out in 5 years, 50.1% of those granted were built out in 4 years, 40.6% in 3 years, 21.7% in 2 years and 2.2% in 1 year. When these percentages are applied to the 283 windfall figure we get a total of 476 new windfall dwellings not on the system as at 1st April 2012 that may be built before 1st April 2017. This is demonstrated in the table below.

Figure 7: Build out rates

Year	Build Out %	Cumulative %	Windfalls	Build Out
2014/15	2.2	53.7	283	152
2015/16	19.6	50.1	283	142
2016/17	18.8	40.6	283	115
2017/18	9.5	21.7	283	62
2018/19	3.6	2.2	283	6
Total				476

3.23 Calculating the number of windfall outline permissions granted on new sites is more difficult, but based on the last 3 years data there would be an average of 218.6 dwellings granted each year. This gives a total of 1093.3 dwellings. Assuming a much lower total build out rate of 20% this would give a figure of 218.6 Dwellings.

Dwellings under Construction

3.24 Dwellings under construction are included in the supply and treated the same as planning permissions.

Conclusions on the 'Deliverable' Supply

3.25 The table below summarises the 5 year supply situation in Barnsley for 2014/15 to 2018/19

Figure 8: 5 year supply summary

5 Year Supply Summary	
Category	Gross 'Deliverable' Dwellings
Planning Permissions >= 10 Dwellings	2263
Remaining UDP Housing Proposals	152
Redundant School Sites	347
Permissions < 10 Dwellings	437

Additional Sites	958
Windfall Allowance	695
5 Year 'Deliverable' Gross Supply Total	4852
Predicted Losses	125
5 Year 'Deliverable' Net Supply Total	4727

4. Overall Conclusion

4.1 This report lays out the methodology used by the Council to arrive at the net requirement for the 2014/15 – 2018/19 period and the supply of dwellings that can be demonstrated to be deliverable in that period. 4727 net dwellings can be delivered against a requirement for 7062 net dwellings.

4.2 The Council cannot currently demonstrate a supply of specific, deliverable sites sufficient to meet the boroughs housing requirement. In this situation the NPPF is clear, at paragraph 49, that relevant policies for the supply of housing should not be considered up to date. As a result applications for residential planning permission in the borough (including proposals on UDP Safeguarded Land and UDP Urban Land to Remain Undeveloped allocations), where it can be demonstrated that they are in a sustainable location, will now be determined in line with the NPPF Presumption in Favour of Sustainable Development (paragraph 14 of the NPPF), relevant development plan policies and any other material considerations.

Appendix 1 – The Original Core Strategy 2008-2026 Housing Trajectory

Year	Gross Dwellings	Demolitions	Net Dwellings
2008-09	1096	236	860
2009-10	797	251	546
2010-11	850	150	700
2011-12	900	100	800
2012-13	950	88	862
2013-14	1100	104	996
2014-15	1150	50	1100
2015-16	1250	50	1200
2016-17	1450	50	1400
2017-18	1500	50	1450
2018-19	1500	50	1450
2019-20	1500	50	1450
2020-21	1500	50	1450
2021-22	1500	50	1450
2022-23	1500	50	1450
2023-24	1500	50	1450
2024-25	1500	50	1450
2025-26	1500	50	1450
2008/26	23043	1529	21514