

**Barnsley Five Year 'Deliverable' Housing Land  
Supply Report  
April 2012 – March 2017**



**BARNSLEY**  
Metropolitan Borough Council

PREPARED BY BARNSLEY METROPOLITAN BOROUGH COUNCIL

October 2013

## **Barnsley Housing Supply – 1<sup>st</sup> April 2012 – 31<sup>st</sup> March 2017**

### **5 Year ‘Deliverable’ Housing Land Supply**

#### **Contents**

1. Introduction	3
2. The Requirement	3
3. The ‘Deliverable’ Supply	5
4. Overall Conclusion	8
5. Appendix 1: Original Core Strategy Housing Trajectory	9
6. Appendix 2: Schedule of Sites with Planning Permission for over 10 Dwellings	
7. Appendix 3: Schedule of Remaining UDP Housing Allocations	
8. Appendix 4: Schedule of Redundant School Sites	

*Appendixes 2 to 4 are available as a separate document on the Council website.*

## 1. Introduction

1.1 Barnsley Core Strategy policy CSP9 states that ‘a minimum five year supply of deliverable sites will be maintained’ for residential development. Additionally since the adoption of the Core Strategy the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) has been published. The NPPF is clear that Local Planning Authorities should ‘identify and update annually a supply of specific, deliverable sites to provide five years worth of housing against their housing requirements’ (Paragraph 47).

1.2 The purpose of this note is to lay out how the authority determines what the housing requirement is for the relevant five year period and to explain how the supply of housing sites in the borough has been assessed to determine ‘deliverability’ as defined in footnote 11 of the NPPF.

1.3 This note is a follow up to the earlier reports for the periods 2007 - 2012, 2008 - 2013, 2009 - 2014 and 2010 – 2015. However the structure and methodologies used in this report differ from those utilised in earlier notes. This is as a result of a review of best practice elsewhere including relevant appeal decisions, methods employed by other Local Planning Authorities and published guidance.

1.4 The note concludes that for this five year period the authority cannot demonstrate a ‘deliverable’ five year supply.

1.5 Site schedules are provided in the appendices to this note laying out in detail the deliverability assessment for all sites with planning permission for more than ten dwellings, remaining undeveloped Unitary Development Plan (UDP) housing proposals and redundant school sites. Site schedule appendices can be found in a separate document available on the Councils website alongside this report. Details of the methodologies used to assess deliverability of different types of site are explained in detail in section 3 of this note.

## 2. The Requirement

### *Updating the Trajectory*

2.1 Core Strategy policy CSP9 includes a requirement for 21500 net new homes over the plan period from 2008/09 to 2025/26. As the plan period progresses the trajectory is updated with actual completion data. Any surplus or deficit that results from this exercise is then redistributed through the rest of the plan period. For example if a surplus exists this number is divided by the remaining years in the plan period and the requirement reduced in each year by the required amount. If a deficit exists the requirement would be increased in each year by the relevant amount.

2.2 The table below shows actual net completions compared to the net trajectory requirement between the start of the Core Strategy plan period in 2008/09 and 2011/12. For 2008/09 and 2009/10 the net trajectory requirement was calculated using actual data on losses in those years as understood at the time the original trajectory was drawn up. The original Core Strategy trajectory can be found in appendix 1. Additional data since this time has lead to slight adjustments to the numbers for 2009/10 as shown in the actual net completions column below. From 2010/11 onwards the net trajectory requirement is calculated using an estimate of losses from the gross trajectory requirement. Any difference between the net trajectory requirement and net actual completions needs to be accommodated through the trajectory for the rest of the plan period as discussed above.

Year	Gross Trajectory Requirement	Net Trajectory Requirement	Net Actual Completions	Difference Between Requirement and Completions
08/09	1096	860	860	0
09/10	797	546	556	+10
10/11	850	700	1000	+300
11/12	900	800	841	+41
<b>Total</b>	<b>3643</b>	<b>2906</b>	<b>3257</b>	<b>+351</b>

2.3 The above table shows that the borough is in surplus over this period by 351 dwellings. This reduces the net requirement over the remaining plan period (2012/13 to 2025/26) by 25 dwellings a year. The gross requirement also needs to be adjusted by the same amount. Additionally the original Core Strategy trajectory estimated that 737 dwellings would be lost over the first four years of the plan period but monitoring data shows that 707 dwellings were actually lost equating to a difference of 30 dwellings. As a result the gross requirement and losses across the rest of the plan period need to be adjusted to take account of this.

2.4 The table below shows the housing trajectory over the remainder of the plan period taking into account adjustments as laid out above. This revised and updated trajectory is used to determine the basic net requirement for the 2012/13 to 2016/17 five year period.

<b>Updated 2012/13 Barnsley Housing Trajectory (2008/09 to 2025/26)</b>			
Year	Gross Dwellings	Losses	Net Dwellings
2008-09*	1096	236	860
2009-10*	793	237	556
2010-11*	1155	155	1000
2011-12*	920	79	841
<b>2012-13</b>	<b>921</b>	<b>85</b>	<b>836</b>
<b>2013-14</b>	<b>1072</b>	<b>101</b>	<b>971</b>
<b>2014-15</b>	<b>1123</b>	<b>48</b>	<b>1075</b>
<b>2015-16</b>	<b>1223</b>	<b>48</b>	<b>1175</b>
<b>2016-17</b>	<b>1423</b>	<b>48</b>	<b>1375</b>
2017-18	1473	48	1425
2018-19	1473	48	1425
2019-20	1473	48	1425
2020-21	1473	48	1425
2021-22	1473	48	1425
2022-23	1473	48	1425
2023-24	1473	48	1425
2024-25	1473	48	1425
2025-26	1473	48	1425
<b>2008/26 overall requirement</b>	<b>22983</b>	<b>1469</b>	<b>21514</b>
<b>2012/13 – 2025/26 requirement</b>	<b>19019</b>	<b>762</b>	<b>18257</b>
<b>2012/13-2016/17 five year requirement</b>	<b>5762</b>	<b>330</b>	<b>5432</b>

\* Based on actual recorded completions and losses.

2.5 The basic five year net requirement for the 2012/13 to 2016/17 period is 5432 dwellings net.

### *The NPPF Buffer*

2.6 The NPPF requires that the five year housing net requirement is buffered by bringing forward an additional 5% of the basic net requirement from later in the plan period. This is to 'ensure choice and competition in the market for land'. Where there 'has been a record of persistent under delivery of housing' this buffer should increase to 20%.

2.7 The table below lays out housing delivery in the borough over the last 8 years and compares it to the annual net requirement for each year.

Year	Gross Dwellings	Losses	Net Dwellings	Net Requirement
2004-05	1497	192	1305	840
2005-06	1101	166	935	840
2006-07	1096	177	919	840
2007-08	1499	355	1144	840
2008-09	1096	236	860	860
2009-10	793	237	556	546
2010-11	1155	155	1000	700
2011-12	920	79	841	800

1. The net requirement for 2002-03 to 2007-08 is derived from the Yorkshire & Humber Regional Spatial Strategy which has now been revoked but which set the borough's requirement at this time.

2. The net requirement for 2007-08 to 2011-12 is derived from the original Core Strategy trajectory.

2.8 The above table demonstrates that Barnsley has a record of consistently delivering housing to its net requirement. This justifies the use of a 5% buffer as described above.

2.9 The table below lays out the net requirement taking into account an NPPF buffer of 5%

Year	Original Core Strategy Trajectory Net Requirement	Adjusted Net Requirement (08/09 – 11/12 Surplus, - 25 dwellings a year)	5% NPPF Buffer	Actual Net Requirement
12/13	862	836	42	878
13/14	996	971	49	1020
14/15	1100	1075	54	1129
15/16	1200	1175	59	1234
16/17	1400	1375	69	1444
<b>Total</b>	<b>5558</b>	<b>5432</b>	<b>273</b>	<b>5705</b>

2.10 The above table shows that the overall net requirement for the borough for the five year period 2012/13 to 2016/17 is 5705 net dwellings.

### 3. The 'Deliverable' Supply

#### *Overall Supply*

3.1 The table below lays out the overall gross supply in the borough as of 1<sup>st</sup> April 2012 without any adjustments to account for 'deliverability'.

Dwellings with Planning Permission on Sites with 10 or more Dwellings	Dwellings with Planning Permission on sites with less than 10 Dwellings	UDP Housing Proposal	Redundant School Sites	Total Supply
3810	798	1949	1559	8116

3.2 The NPPF is clear that sites in the forward supply need to be assessed for 'deliverability'. Footnote 11 of the NPPF expands on this and states that:

*'To be considered deliverable, sites should be available now, offer a suitable location for development now, and be achievable with a realistic prospect that housing will be delivered on the site within five years and in particular that development of the site is viable. Sites with planning permission should be considered deliverable until permission expires, unless there is clear evidence that schemes will not be implemented within five years, for example they will not be viable, there is no longer a demand for the type of units or sites have long term phasing plans'.*

This definition has been taken into account when assessing sites for 'deliverability' and this is expanded upon in the relevant sections below.

#### *Assessment of Deliverability*

##### *Sites with planning permission for 10 dwellings or more*

3.3 The NPPF is clear that sites with planning permission should be considered deliverable until the permission expires unless there is clear evidence that they will not be implemented in the five year period.

3.4 We asked for evidence of delivery from applicants and/or landowners. We did this through a questionnaire, following up with phone calls in the event of non-response. We have used this market information to demonstrate the deliverable supply

3.5 Where it was not possible to gain a market response about a site an Officer Assessment Group was formed to assess each site based on local knowledge. The conclusions of this group have been used to demonstrate the deliverable supply on sites where the Council was not able to get a response. Additionally some sites deliverability was assessed by research (for example where the site is now built out or has been granted planning permission after 1<sup>st</sup> April 2012).

3.6 The schedule in Appendix 2 lays out the deliverability assessment for each of these sites.

3.7 Based on the methodology outlined above from the 3810 dwellings with planning permission on larger sites 1717 are considered to be deliverable over the five year period.

##### *Sites with planning permission for fewer than 10 dwellings*

3.8 It is not practical to assess deliverability on small sites with less than 10 dwellings on a site by site basis. Therefore an evidentially derived discount has been used. This was calculated by analysing the 5 year build out rates for dwellings with full planning consent that had not been completed on the monitoring system in 2005, 2006 and 2007. These were fairly constant at a build out rate of 70% in 2005 and 2007 and 69% in 2006. As a result a build out rate of 70% of permitted dwellings was applied to all dwellings included in full permissions for less than ten dwellings on the monitoring system on 1<sup>st</sup> April 2012. At this date there were 669 dwellings with full planning permission on smaller sites. With a build out discount of 70% of the total supply this means that 468 dwellings will be deliverable over the five year period.

3.9 The average build out rate for small outline permissions was estimated at 30%. There were 129 dwellings with outline permission on small sites on the monitoring system as at 1<sup>st</sup> April 2012 giving a total of 39 dwellings that will be deliverable over the five year period. In total this means there will be 507 deliverable dwellings from sites with permission for less than 10 dwellings over the five year period.

##### *Undeveloped UDP Housing Proposals*

3.10 There are a number of UDP housing proposals in the borough that have not been developed. These have been assessed using the same methods as used to assess larger

planning applications which are laid out above (paragraphs 3.5 – 3.6). Additionally as many of these sites are in Council ownership officers have liaised with colleagues responsible for asset disposal in order to assess deliverability. This market information has been used to demonstrate the deliverable supply on sites where the Council was able to get a response. Where no response was received the Officer Assessment Group conclusions have been used to demonstrate the deliverable supply.

3.11 The Schedule in Appendix 3 lays out the deliverability assessment for each of these sites.

3.12 There is the potential for 1949 dwellings on UDP housing proposals. Based on the methodology outlined above 433 dwellings are considered to be deliverable over the five year period on these sites.

#### *Redundant School Sites*

3.13 The borough has a number of large, redundant school sites that may come forward for development in the five year period. All these sites are in Council ownership and as a result officers have liaised with colleagues responsible for asset disposal in order to assess deliverability. This market information has been use to demonstrate the deliverable supply on these sites.

3.14 The Schedule in Appendix 3 lays out the deliverability assessment for each of these sites.

3.15 There is the potential for 1559 dwellings on redundant school sites. Using the methodology outlined above 210 dwellings are considered to be developable over the five year period on these sites.

#### *Windfall Allowance*

3.16 The NPPF, at paragraph 48, states that local planning authorities may make an allowance for windfalls in their five year supply 'if they have compelling evidence that such sites have consistently become available in the local area and will continue to provide a reliable source of supply'. It is important to consider the NPPF definition of windfalls in relation to this paragraph as 'sites which have not been specifically identified as available in the local plan process'. Therefore sites included in the borough's SHLAA are not windfalls.

3.17 Windfalls have historically comprised a significant element of completions in the borough and it is reasonable to include an allowance in the five year supply. A methodology has been devised to calculate an allowance which is based on evidence taking into account the NPPF windfall definition.

3.18 The number of full and reserved matters windfall dwellings (as defined in the NPPF) granted, on new sites, in the last 3 years is shown below:

<b>Year</b>	<b>Windfall Dwellings</b>
2009/10	473
2010/11	375
2011/12	306

3.19 The methodology takes an average of the above 3 years to arrive at an estimate that 385 windfalls will be granted each year up to 2016/17. Evidence from 2006/07 shows what percent of windfalls granted were built out in the 5 subsequent years (Build Out % in the table below). When this is applied cumulatively 55% of those granted in the first year were built out in 5 years, 50.9% of those granted were built out in 4 years, 47.1% in 3 years, 31% in 2 years and 2.0% in 1 year. When these percentages are applied to the 385 windfall

figure we get a total of 721 new windfall dwellings not on the system as at 1<sup>st</sup> April 2012 that may be built before 1<sup>st</sup> April 2017. This is demonstrated in the table below.

Year	Build Out %	Cumulative %	Windfalls	Build Out
2012/13	2.9	55.0	385	212
2013/14	28.5	50.9	385	196
2014/15	15.6	47.1	385	181
2015/16	3.9	31.4	385	121
2016/17	4.0	2.9	385	11
<b>Total</b>				<b>721</b>

3.20 Calculating the number of windfall outline permissions granted on new sites is more difficult, but based on the last 3 years data there would be an average of 36 dwellings granted each year. This gives a total of 182 dwellings. Assuming a much lower total build out rate of 25% this would give a figure of 45 Dwellings (all numbers in this paragraph are rounded).

#### *Dwellings under Construction*

3.21 Dwellings under construction are included in the supply and treated the same as planning permissions.

#### *Conclusions on the 'Deliverable' Supply*

3.22 The table below summarises the 5 year supply situation in Barnsley for 2012/13 to 2016/17

<b>5 Year Supply Summary</b>	
<b>Category</b>	<b>Gross 'Deliverable' Dwellings</b>
Planning Permissions >= 10 Dwellings	1717
Remaining UDP Housing Proposals	433
Redundant School Sites	210
Permissions < 10 Dwellings	507
Windfall Allowance	766
<b>5 Year 'Deliverable' Gross Supply Total</b>	<b>3633</b>
Predicted Losses	330
<b>5 Year 'Deliverable' Net Supply Total</b>	<b>3303</b>

#### 4. Overall Conclusion

4.1 This report lays out the methodology used by the Council to arrive at the net requirement for the 2012/13 – 2016/17 period and the supply of dwellings that can be demonstrated to be deliverable in that period. 3303 net dwellings can be delivered against a requirement for 5705 net dwellings.

4.2 The Council cannot currently demonstrate a supply of specific, deliverable sites sufficient to meet the boroughs housing requirement. In this situation the NPPF is clear, at paragraph 49, that relevant policies for the supply of housing should not be considered up to date. As a result applications for residential planning permission in the borough (including proposals on UDP Safeguarded Land and UDP Urban Land to Remain Undeveloped allocations), where it can be demonstrated that they are in a sustainable location, will now be



determined in line with the NPPF Presumption in Favour of Sustainable Development (paragraph 14 of the NPPF), relevant development plan policies and any other material considerations.

4.3 The Council will now move expediently to produce a five year supply note with a base date of 1<sup>st</sup> April 2013. This note will take into account any relevant changes to best practice and guidance that have become apparent since the publication of this note.

#### **Appendix 1 – The Original Core Strategy 2008-2026 Housing Trajectory**

<b>Year</b>	<b>Gross Dwellings</b>	<b>Demolitions</b>	<b>Net Dwellings</b>
2008-09	1096	236	860
2009-10	797	251	546
2010-11	850	150	700
2011-12	900	100	800
2012-13	950	88	862
2013-14	1100	104	996
2014-15	1150	50	1100
2015-16	1250	50	1200
2016-17	1450	50	1400
2017-18	1500	50	1450
2018-19	1500	50	1450
2019-20	1500	50	1450
2020-21	1500	50	1450
2021-22	1500	50	1450
2022-23	1500	50	1450
2023-24	1500	50	1450
2024-25	1500	50	1450
2025-26	1500	50	1450
<b>2008/26</b>	<b>23043</b>	<b>1529</b>	<b>21514</b>